

Genesee County Road Commission Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 56-W899
Contract Year: 2010
Description: Base Crush & Shape with 5 inch HMA - 22 feet wide and 4 feet wide HMA shoulders
Location: Jennings Road - Lahring Rd to Thompson Rd
Projects(s): 56-W899

Rank	Bidder	Total Bid	% Over Low	% Over Est.
0	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE	\$850,669.20	4.84%	0%
1	(02985) Zito Construction Co.	\$811,367.00	0%	-4.62%
2	(_1) Cadillac Asphalt LLC	\$818,426.80	0.87%	-3.79%
3	(01411) Barrett Paving Materials, Inc.	\$857,418.86	5.67%	0.79%
4	(00656) Ace Asphalt & Paving Co. Inc.	\$864,270.78	6.52%	1.59%
5	(_96) Dean Holmes Excavating LTD	\$884,931.98	9.06%	4.02%

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE Bid Price	Total	(1) Zito Construction Co. Bid Price	Total	(2) Cadillac Asphalt LLC Bid Price	Total
0001	2020004 Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch	4.00	Ea	\$250.00	\$1,000.00	\$170.00	\$680.00	\$350.00	\$1,400.00

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Zito Construction Co.		(2) Cadillac Asphalt LLC	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0002	2030001 Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	2.00	Ea	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$250.00	\$500.00
0003	2030002 Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	1.00	Ea	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$450.00	\$450.00	\$450.00	\$450.00
0004	2047011 _ Pavt, Rem, Modified	3,460.00	Syd	\$6.00	\$20,760.00	\$2.80	\$9,688.00	\$2.27	\$7,854.20
0005	2057002 _ Ditch Cleanout, Modified	6.00	Sta	\$500.00	\$3,000.00	\$880.00	\$5,280.00	\$150.00	\$900.00
0006	2057002 _ Machine Grading, Modified	12.30	Sta	\$1,000.00	\$12,300.00	\$1,700.00	\$20,910.00	\$276.00	\$3,394.80
0007	2057021 _ Subgrade Undercutting, Type II, Modified	3,000.00	Cyd	\$25.00	\$75,000.00	\$32.00	\$96,000.00	\$35.00	\$105,000.00
0008	2080025 Erosion Control, Silt Fence	500.00	Ft	\$1.50	\$750.00	\$2.00	\$1,000.00	\$1.25	\$625.00
0009	2090001 Project Cleanup	1.00	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,900.00	\$1,900.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
0010	3027002 _ Aggregate Base, Conditioning, Modified	136.00	Sta	\$75.00	\$10,200.00	\$70.00	\$9,520.00	\$41.00	\$5,576.00
0011	3027031 _ Aggregate Base, Modified	6,570.00	Ton	\$20.00	\$131,400.00	\$19.80	\$130,086.00	\$21.72	\$142,700.40
0012	3037011 _ Geogrid	8,700.00	Syd	\$5.00	\$43,500.00	\$4.10	\$35,670.00	\$5.87	\$51,069.00
0013	3037011 _ Geotextile Separator	4,300.00	Syd	\$1.50	\$6,450.00	\$1.45	\$6,235.00	\$1.67	\$7,181.00
0014	3057011 _ HMA Base Crushing and Shaping, Modified	16,932.00	Syd	\$2.00	\$33,864.00	\$1.35	\$22,858.20	\$0.90	\$15,238.80
0015	3067031 _ Maintenance Gravel, Modified	50.00	Ton	\$18.00	\$900.00	\$25.00	\$1,250.00	\$19.28	\$964.00
0016	3077031 _ Approach, CI II, Modified	336.00	Ton	\$25.00	\$8,400.00	\$22.00	\$7,392.00	\$19.90	\$6,686.40
0017	4010000 Culv, CI A, 12 inch	46.00	Ft	\$22.00	\$1,012.00	\$26.00	\$1,196.00	\$35.00	\$1,610.00

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Zito Construction Co.		(2) Cadillac Asphalt LLC	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0018	4010002 Culv, CI A, 18 inch	52.00	Ft	\$30.00	\$1,560.00	\$33.00	\$1,716.00	\$37.00	\$1,924.00
0019	4010005 Culv, CI A, 36 inch	72.00	Ft	\$50.00	\$3,600.00	\$64.00	\$4,608.00	\$40.60	\$2,923.20
0020	4010656 Culv, Slp End Sect, 1 on 4, 36 inch, Longit	2.00	Ea	\$750.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,100.00	\$2,200.00	\$915.00	\$1,830.00
0021	4010666 Culv, Slp End Sect, 1 on 4, 18 inch, Transv	2.00	Ea	\$350.00	\$700.00	\$185.00	\$370.00	\$177.00	\$354.00
0022	4047001 _ House Drain, 4 inch, Special	25.00	Ft	\$10.00	\$250.00	\$1.00	\$25.00	\$10.00	\$250.00
0023	4047001 _ House Drain, 6 inch, Special	25.00	Ft	\$12.00	\$300.00	\$2.00	\$50.00	\$12.00	\$300.00
0024	5020003 Cold Milling HMA Surface	345.00	Syd	\$1.00	\$345.00	\$9.00	\$3,105.00	\$9.00	\$3,105.00
0025	5020034 HMA, 13A	8,173.00	Ton	\$52.00	\$424,996.00	\$48.00	\$392,304.00	\$48.05	\$392,712.65
0026	5020061 HMA Approach	91.00	Ton	\$85.00	\$7,735.00	\$78.00	\$7,098.00	\$49.05	\$4,463.55
0027	5027011 _ HMA Residential Approach, Special	68.00	Syd	\$30.00	\$2,040.00	\$52.00	\$3,536.00	\$50.00	\$3,400.00
0028	5027011 _ HMA Spillway, Special	3.00	Syd	\$50.00	\$150.00	\$100.00	\$300.00	\$50.00	\$150.00
0029	8017011 _ Driveway, Nonreinf Conc, 5 Inch, Modified	16.00	Syd	\$40.00	\$640.00	\$50.00	\$800.00	\$125.00	\$2,000.00
0030	8070095 Post, Mailbox	62.00	Ea	\$50.00	\$3,100.00	\$40.00	\$2,480.00	\$50.00	\$3,100.00
0031	8110056 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, School	2.00	Ea	\$175.00	\$350.00	\$265.00	\$530.00	\$265.00	\$530.00
0032	8110110 Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, White	15,494.00	Ft	\$0.10	\$1,549.40	\$0.15	\$2,324.10	\$0.15	\$2,324.10
0033	8110111 Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow	7,038.00	Ft	\$0.10	\$703.80	\$0.15	\$1,055.70	\$0.15	\$1,055.70

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Zito Construction Co.		(2) Cadillac Asphalt LLC	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0034	8120025 Dust Palliative, Applied	37.00	Ton	\$2.00	\$74.00	\$290.00	\$10,730.00	\$265.00	\$9,805.00
0035	8130010 Riprap, Plain	2.00	Syd	\$40.00	\$80.00	\$100.00	\$200.00	\$65.00	\$130.00
0036	8167011 _ Slope Restoration, Modified	5,360.00	Syd	\$3.50	\$18,760.00	\$2.00	\$10,720.00	\$3.25	\$17,420.00
0037	8217050 _ Monument Box, Special	2.00	Ea	\$100.00	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$150.00	\$300.00
0038	8217050 _ Monument Preservation, Special	2.00	Ea	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$450.00	\$900.00	\$300.00	\$600.00
0039	8217050 _ Protect Corners, Special	2.00	Ea	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$300.00	\$600.00
0040	8507051 _ Maintaining Traffic, Special	1.00	LS	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$16,000.00	\$16,000.00
Bid Totals:					\$850,669.20		\$811,367.00		\$818,426.80

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Barrett Paving Materials, Inc.		(4) Ace Asphalt & Paving Co. Inc.		(5) Dean Holmes Excavating LTD	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	2020004	4.00	Ea	\$350.00	\$1,400.00	\$225.00	\$900.00	\$375.00	\$1,500.00
	Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch								
0002	2030001	2.00	Ea	\$250.00	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$101.50	\$203.00
	Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch								
0003	2030002	1.00	Ea	\$450.00	\$450.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$178.00	\$178.00
	Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch								
0004	2047011	3,460.00	Syd	\$2.27	\$7,854.20	\$3.50	\$12,110.00	\$5.14	\$17,784.40
	_ Pavt, Rem, Modified								
0005	2057002	6.00	Sta	\$150.00	\$900.00	\$880.00	\$5,280.00	\$514.00	\$3,084.00
	_ Ditch Cleanout, Modified								
0006	2057002	12.30	Sta	\$276.00	\$3,394.80	\$1,800.00	\$22,140.00	\$579.67	\$7,129.94
	_ Machine Grading, Modified								
0007	2057021	3,000.00	Cyd	\$35.00	\$105,000.00	\$34.00	\$102,000.00	\$46.72	\$140,160.00
	_ Subgrade Undercutting, Type II, Modified								
0008	2080025	500.00	Ft	\$1.25	\$625.00	\$2.00	\$1,000.00	\$0.91	\$455.00
	Erosion Control, Silt Fence								
0009	2090001	1.00	LS	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$3,812.00	\$3,812.00
	Project Cleanup								
0010	3027002	136.00	Sta	\$41.00	\$5,576.00	\$80.00	\$10,880.00	\$87.25	\$11,866.00
	_ Aggregate Base, Conditioning, Modified								
0011	3027031	6,570.00	Ton	\$21.72	\$142,700.40	\$20.80	\$136,656.00	\$19.62	\$128,903.40
	_ Aggregate Base, Modified								
0012	3037011	8,700.00	Syd	\$5.87	\$51,069.00	\$4.20	\$36,540.00	\$6.16	\$53,592.00
	_ Geogrid								
0013	3037011	4,300.00	Syd	\$1.67	\$7,181.00	\$1.50	\$6,450.00	\$1.44	\$6,192.00
	_ Geotextile Separator								
0014	3057011	16,932.00	Syd	\$0.90	\$15,238.80	\$1.39	\$23,535.48	\$1.39	\$23,535.48
	_ HMA Base Crushing and Shaping, Modified								
0015	3067031	50.00	Ton	\$19.28	\$964.00	\$25.00	\$1,250.00	\$21.00	\$1,050.00
	_ Maintenance Gravel, Modified								
0016	3077031	336.00	Ton	\$19.90	\$6,686.40	\$23.00	\$7,728.00	\$21.21	\$7,126.56
	_ Approach, CI II, Modified								

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Barrett Paving Materials, Inc.		(4) Ace Asphalt & Paving Co. Inc.		(5) Dean Holmes Excavating LTD	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0017	4010000 Culv, CI A, 12 inch	46.00	Ft	\$35.00	\$1,610.00	\$26.00	\$1,196.00	\$31.23	\$1,436.58
0018	4010002 Culv, CI A, 18 inch	52.00	Ft	\$37.00	\$1,924.00	\$33.00	\$1,716.00	\$45.85	\$2,384.20
0019	4010005 Culv, CI A, 36 inch	72.00	Ft	\$40.60	\$2,923.20	\$64.00	\$4,608.00	\$56.78	\$4,088.16
0020	4010656 Culv, Slp End Sect, 1 on 4, 36 inch, Longit	2.00	Ea	\$915.00	\$1,830.00	\$1,100.00	\$2,200.00	\$783.36	\$1,566.72
0021	4010666 Culv, Slp End Sect, 1 on 4, 18 inch, Transv	2.00	Ea	\$177.00	\$354.00	\$185.00	\$370.00	\$108.40	\$216.80
0022	4047001 _ House Drain, 4 inch, Special	25.00	Ft	\$10.00	\$250.00	\$1.00	\$25.00	\$3.80	\$95.00
0023	4047001 _ House Drain, 6 inch, Special	25.00	Ft	\$12.00	\$300.00	\$2.00	\$50.00	\$4.80	\$120.00
0024	5020003 Cold Milling HMA Surface	345.00	Syd	\$9.00	\$3,105.00	\$9.00	\$3,105.00	\$14.00	\$4,830.00
0025	5020034 HMA, 13A	8,173.00	Ton	\$48.00	\$392,304.00	\$47.70	\$389,852.10	\$47.70	\$389,852.10
0026	5020061 HMA Approach	91.00	Ton	\$96.00	\$8,736.00	\$78.00	\$7,098.00	\$78.00	\$7,098.00
0027	5027011 _ HMA Residential Approach, Special	68.00	Syd	\$48.50	\$3,298.00	\$41.55	\$2,825.40	\$41.55	\$2,825.40
0028	5027011 _ HMA Spillway, Special	3.00	Syd	\$350.00	\$1,050.00	\$50.00	\$150.00	\$50.00	\$150.00
0029	8017011 _ Driveway, Nonreinf Conc, 5 Inch, Modified	16.00	Syd	\$100.00	\$1,600.00	\$50.00	\$800.00	\$3.50	\$56.00
0030	8070095 Post, Mailbox	62.00	Ea	\$100.00	\$6,200.00	\$50.00	\$3,100.00	\$46.32	\$2,871.84
0031	8110056 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, School	2.00	Ea	\$265.00	\$530.00	\$265.00	\$530.00	\$265.00	\$530.00
0032	8110110 Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, White	15,494.00	Ft	\$0.15	\$2,324.10	\$0.15	\$2,324.10	\$0.15	\$2,324.10

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Barrett Paving Materials, Inc.		(4) Ace Asphalt & Paving Co. Inc.		(5) Dean Holmes Excavating LTD	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0033	8110111	7,038.00	Ft	\$0.15	\$1,055.70	\$0.15	\$1,055.70	\$0.15	\$1,055.70
	Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow								
0034	8120025	37.00	Ton	\$247.98	\$9,175.26	\$320.00	\$11,840.00	\$265.00	\$9,805.00
	Dust Palliative, Applied								
0035	8130010	2.00	Syd	\$65.00	\$130.00	\$100.00	\$200.00	\$99.00	\$198.00
	Riprap, Plain								
0036	8167011	5,360.00	Syd	\$3.00	\$16,080.00	\$2.10	\$11,256.00	\$3.56	\$19,081.60
	_ Slope Restoration, Modified								
0037	8217050	2.00	Ea	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$150.00	\$300.00
	_ Monument Box, Special								
0038	8217050	2.00	Ea	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$225.00	\$450.00
	_ Monument Preservation, Special								
0039	8217050	2.00	Ea	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$225.00	\$450.00
	_ Protect Corners, Special								
0040	8507051	1.00	LS	\$47,500.00	\$47,500.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$26,575.00	\$26,575.00
	_ Maintaining Traffic, Special								
Bid Totals:				\$857,418.86		\$864,270.78		\$884,931.98	